City Streets – Progressive Adelaide 75 Years On
Lance Campbell and Mick Bradley
Wakefield Press, 2012
ISBN: 9781862549203

This sumptuously produced A3, landscape format, hard back volume records the fascinating changes which have occurred to Adelaide City’s streets over a period of 75 years. It is a ‘before and after’ exercise relying on a former publication released in 1936 to mark the first Centenary of the establishment of Adelaide. That publication entitled ‘Progressive Adelaide – As it stands today’ was produced by Gustav Herman Baring. Baring had an entrepreneurial motive to engage with building owners helping to finance the publication and to publicise the work of his printing company. But he also had an altruistic vision of documenting the achievements of Adelaide and South Australia over its first 100 years since settlement began in streets as originally laid out by surveyor Colonel William Light.

The contemporary work is unclear about who took all the original photographs 75 years ago, stating: ‘As far as is known Baring took the photographs for this mammoth undertaking apart from bonus pages for regional centres such as Port Lincoln’. Those photographs did indeed represent a mammoth effort, relying on a tripod mounted large plate camera, painstakingly moved to all the viewing points around the city. Nevertheless, the very high effective resolution of the large plate format has ensured a level of sharpness and detail in the black and white images which easily stand comparison with the contemporary shots in full colour.

Fast forward to the present and with the encouragement of Adelaide City Council’s heritage architect John Greenshields and Councillor Sandy Wilkinson the incredible time capsule quality of the original work was recognised and authors Campbell and Bradley were brought in to re-enact the recording process all over again. This involved photographing every one of the original addresses and ultimately manipulating some 1800 images to form the current views of Adelaide from the same positions. In the new publication, the old and new photograph strips are mostly lined up above each other. In this arrangement it is easy to compare and understand the changes which have occurred. The contemporary views also contain captions giving the names and dates of the historic buildings.

From a technical standpoint it is amazing to see how well the work was originally accomplished by Baring, well before the benefits available to contemporary photographers using digital manipulation and enhancement. For the original book it was necessary to cut and paste photographs together to form the panoramic street view strips. In the current version this was done electronically. And there are other problems confronting the contemporary photography postproduction process, such as replicating the original viewing positions and focal lengths of lenses used. For the casual observer these complications have been overcome very effectively.
The authors have also tracked down the history of the buildings which have been photographed and the changes in use which have occurred over time. In some cases the streetscapes are clearly recognisable while in others the pressure from redevelopment has radically changed the low scale country town image which emerges from the Adelaide as photographed in the years from 1934 to 1936.

The King William Street East side between Perry Street and industries is one example of very little change and the contemporary photograph is clearly recognisable. Another example is North Terrace south side between Gawler Place and King William Street. However much has changed in streets such as the Rundle Mall on both its northern and southern sides and East Terrace on the west side between Grenville Street and North Terrace. Overall, however, one cannot but be amazed and impressed that so many of Adelaide’s buildings have been conserved whereas in other Australian capitals, most notably Sydney, relatively little has survived the intense pace of redevelopment since the Second World War.

Inevitably the question arises whether the redevelopment processes which have occurred mostly in post-war Adelaide have made the city a better place in terms of urban design and streetscape? Many of the contemporary images reveal that infill redevelopment has been less than sensitive to the surroundings, with few instances of new architecture forming a satisfactory juxtaposition in terms of scale and contemporary design treatment.

While the original book is an invaluable time capsule so will this volume become recognised in the future. Inevitably in the next 75 years many of the historic buildings which remain to the present will have suffered the same fate as those that have been replaced. It is an inevitable result of the pressure of economics addressing the sustainability of buildings which have passed their use-by dates, and suffering from development control failings in government.

On one level one might be tempted to dismiss this work as a ‘coffee table page turner’ but to my mind it has a far more serious purpose which is to document history and impress on a wide reading public the importance of conservation of our cultural heritage. Campbell and Bradley deserve particular commendation for their devotion to the accuracy and technical quality which has gone into this work. For anyone who has lived and worked in the City of Adelaide, the loss of certain buildings will be particularly poignant and hopefully serve to marshal even stronger action against thoughtless badly designed redevelopment in the future. I give it five stars.

Dr Rodney Jensen
Architect and urban designer
Member of ICOMOS

---

**Many Voices: One Vision: The Early Years of the World Heritage Convention**

Christina Cameron and Mechtild Rössler
Ashgate Publishing Ltd., 2013
ISBN: 9781409410379

This book is essential reading for anyone interested in the evolution of the World Heritage Convention and the development of the criteria for assessment of places for inclusion on the World Heritage List. It is of special interest to those working with World Heritage criteria and the Operational Guidelines as they can trace developments in relation to changing philosophies and States Party interventions. After discussing post war parallel developments in cultural and natural conservation, it is based on the decisions of the WH Committee from their archival records and interviews with key players at points along this evolutionary path.

While the 299 page book is presented in six chapters, the two largest ones deal with ‘Populating the World Heritage List: 1978-2000’ and ‘Conserving World Heritage Sites’. This reflects the attempts to balance the number of cultural and natural heritage sites, given the pioneers belief that the List should be highly selective, represent ‘the best of the best’ and consist of ‘about
100 foremost properties’. This is the figure Rob Milne of the US delegation told me when I was a visiting planner with the US National Park Service in 1977. Now it is 1,000…

The role of strict nature conservation assessment influenced by United States practice is highlighted and the struggles to deal with ‘humanised landscapes’ which resulted in the cultural landscape criteria introduced in 1992, following the failure to list the English Lakes District and the revelation of the inconsistencies between the Convention text and the evaluation criteria. It took a decade to resolve these theoretical issues. But this led to even more nominations given that ‘nature was the consolation prize for countries that lacked monuments’ [p.70]. In 2000 only 20% of the List was natural heritage sites, so the Global Study was introduced to create an equitable regional and cultural distribution. This in turn highlighted lack of tentative lists and inadequate comparative frameworks. ICOMOS prepared thematic studies from 1990 but then the UNESCO secretariat took over these studies.

The Global Strategy enabled the WH Committee to move from a typology-focused list to a thematic one. The 1994 Nara Document on Authenticity, which is a relativist view on assessing authenticity within specific cultural contexts, ‘irrevocably altered the WH selection process for cultural properties’ (ICOMOS 1994: 90). Regional meetings followed and I participated in those in Sydney discussing intangible dimensions of sites in Asia-Pacific in 1995 and in 1999 in Banska Štiavnica, Slovakia, on management guidelines for cultural landscapes. From 2000 the requirement to identify sites of outstanding universal value fostered an intense global dialogue about heritage theory and practice. The authors believe that ‘The Convention’s evolution [in one generation] could be characterized by the disappearance of the notion of the artistic masterpiece, the emergence of an anthropological concept of cultural heritage, the reinterpretation of the concept of authenticity and the articulation of cultural landscapes as the connecting tissue between culture and nature’ (ICOMOS 1994: 101).

The World Heritage Convention has become arguably the most influential instrument in heritage conservation globally and in Australia, especially after the creation in 1974 of the Australian Heritage Commission. Chapter 4 outlines the management concerns from boundary delineation, tourism and mining impacts, site management, development of reactive and periodic monitoring, World Heritage in Danger listing and international assistance including lack of adequate site management funding. Australia looms large in this chapter. From ‘the memorable leadership’ of Barry Jones achieving a resolution on periodic monitoring and reporting at the 1995 WHC session [pp.133-135] to the proposed In Danger listing of Kakadu due to uranium mining at Jabiluka [pp.147-150] which caused an extraordinary session devoted to a single conservation issue for the first time in the history of the Committee.

The players discussed in Chapter 5 are the State Parties, the advisory bodies – IUCN, ICOMOS, ICCROM, UNESCO secretariat and the WH Centre, and civil society – voices wanting to be heard. Again Australia looms large although many of our actors are unnamed beyond WH Committee chair Professor Ralph Slatyer 1978-83 and Dr Sarah Titchen at the WH Centre from 1996 to mid 2000s. Yet Australia has been a huge contributor both in the Committee and in advisory bodies.

The politicisation of the World Heritage Committee was foreshadowed by Ralph Slatyer in 1983 when he suggested countries withhold nominations during their membership of the WH Committee to avoid conflict of interest. And although IUCN’s Jim Thorsell noted that Australia was leading in the implementation of the WH Convention both in government policy and in conservation, the internal tussle over resource extraction in federal and State governments about the inscription of the Wet Tropics of Queensland spilled into the WH forum (p.170). Author Christina Cameron in her role as Canadian delegate was lobbied overnight with Queensland government letters pushed under her Paris hotel door but she does not reveal these colourful episodes in this book. Kakadu created the most dramatic situation in World Heritage credibility in 1999 due to its explosive international components – rights of Indigenous peoples, the right to extract resources for economic reasons, the commitment to conserve WH sites, and the growth of the world-wide antinuclear movement. The heritage discussions changed from technical to political as did the States Party representatives at WH Committee.
Although the text of the WH Convention has remained unchanged, its implementation reflects changing perceptions of the nature of heritage and approaches to conservation. Some are alarmed that the system is imploding under its own weight, others that it is being compromised by geopolitical considerations and rivalries. But its singular vision of the rich connection between culture and natural heritage discussed by many voices, many people, is its greatest success.

While this book analyses the ‘early years’ and shows the origins of continuing issues within the Convention, we look forward to the next volume analysing the huge expansion in World Heritage listed places this century. It provides an excellent context and illustrates that we need a history of the rich Australian contribution to the development and implementation of the World Heritage system.

Jane Lennon
Jane Lennon and Associates, Heritage Consultants

Towards World Heritage: International Origins of the Preservation Movement 1870-1930
Melanie Hall (ed.)
Ashgate Publishing Ltd., 2012
ISBN: 9781409407720

Towards World Heritage is an interesting and often insightful look at how the preservation movement began, offered as part of Ashgate’s ‘Heritage, Culture and Identity’ series. The book considers the foundation and evolution of global heritage and the roles particular countries, groups and organisations have played in shaping our opinions and attitudes. Melanie Hall has collected an array of articles and conference papers from leading academics in the field of heritage, with case studies and contributions from Britain, France, Germany, Sweden and the United States.

Hall divides her work into two parts: part one consists of five case studies of international action to conserve heritage places before 1930; while part two considers developing heritage legislation, theories employed by contemporaries and the role of governments and private organisations in preserving heritage. Hall’s selection of articles is extremely thoughtful and each academic demonstrates their comprehensive understanding of the topic and questions posed. The numerous quotations are particularly insightful, enabling the reader to better understand contemporary attitudes to heritage preservation. Of the case studies, those by Hall, Goldstein and Cohen are the most interesting and engaging. Each article concisely explains the history of their respective heritage site and presents a narrative timeline of the events and actions taken to preserve them. The authors also provide an explanation of the intriguing politics and international dialogue surrounding each site.

The analysis of developing legislation, governments and organisations of part two complements the case studies of the first part. In her introduction, Hall justifies her selection of Anglo-European focused articles and Swenson’s contribution, a comparison of legislation in Britain, France and Germany, introduces this discussion well. However, Britain has received too much of the focus and there was a missed opportunity to consider more fully developments beyond Britain and Europe.

Wetterberg’s article, ‘Conservation and Profession: The Swedish Context 1880-1920’, is noteworthy as it considers attitudes towards public and ‘vernacular’ heritage buildings. The article discusses the value that Swedish people have instilled in preserving their ‘folk culture’. Wetterberg’s article also complements the case studies by Cohen and Goldstein, discussing the challenging situations where two or more heritage organisations compete to preserve a particular building. The Swedish discussion and comparison of competing government organisations grounds the more problematic situations of the heritage of St. Sophia and Bethlehem.
The examination of the multi-disciplinary nature of the heritage profession provided a connecting theme throughout the book. The authors discuss conflicts and agreements between architects, historians, art historians and archaeologists and the dynamics each group have with particular organisations and governments in their respective countries. Countries were similarly discussed and evaluated for their reliance on historians or architects and government or private funding for preserving their heritage. The consensus, that the US government was hands-off and preservation was privately funded in comparison to the highly-involved government preservation initiatives of the Europeans, is not a new one but the dialogue provides valuable insight.

A second recurring discussion in the book was about who was interested in heritage, who pioneered heritage groups and who was against the preservation movement. The usual suspects arose, John Ruskin and the National Trusts for example, but analysis of the Daughters of the American Revolution and the Mount Vernon Ladies Association of the Union provided interesting comparisons. This discussion was summarised acutely in Mandle’s article, ‘Rethinking the “Powers of Darkness”’. Mandle explores the dichotomy of left and right wing preservation movements and the varied reincarnations of Ruskin’s ‘stewardship’ preservation theory by states, religious movements, the aristocracy and newly urbanised populations of Britain.

Towards World Heritage is a clear and well-researched history of the origins of the World Heritage movement. It will appeal to both scholars and people with an interest in heritage. Hall’s editing solidifies the discussion and dialogue into one easily comprehensible text which is both a worthwhile addition to the ‘Heritage, Culture and Identity’ series and a good read.

Iain Johnston
Masters in Cultural and Environmental Heritage and PhD candidate at the Australian National University

The Wallpapered Manse; The Rescue of an Endangered House

Peter Freeman
The Watermark Press, 2013
ISBN: 9780992315603

People not wallpapers are the true focus of this book. The wallpapers are important but it’s the people who create and occupy buildings that make places interesting and significant. Peter Freeman brings to life the people associated with this building in Moruya on the NSW south coast, over one hundred and fifty years. You can hear the voices, laughter and perhaps the tears of many generations, including his own. He uses the wallpapers as metaphorical layers of history. We see the church and manse built and first occupied, successive bushfires, droughts and floods, new bridges built, two world wars and the Great Depression as ministers come and go. Then the property is sold to the Bartlett family, previously tenants and eventually its occupants for 55 years. All the while the Presbyterian community endures.

A simple house, the manse was not as dour as might be expected from Presbyterians. For the most part the wallpapers are cheap and cheerful, bold, even gay to use an old-fashioned word. Mock stone ashlar and geometric patterns make way for sprigs of flowers. Then there are the ‘porridge’ papers of the 1930s. Newspapers, hessian and other materials are used as linings. A minister’s daughter’s exercise book with excellent copperplate writing is a poignant example of ‘waste not...’. There must have been squeals of delight followed by intrigue as each successive layer was revealed, especially the twelve layers in the south bedroom, the most intact room.

The manse was purchased in 2009 by the Endangered Houses Fund of the NSW Historic Houses Trust because of its wallpapers. A brief was prepared and Peter Freeman was commissioned as the heritage architect. Substantial changes were anticipated but as many of the 1865 architectural elements were to be retrieved as possible. He sets out the conservation project and adaptive reuse work which saved the house and gave it a future. Emergency works stabilised the structure and rectified various problems. Existing conditions were recorded, appropriate and cost-effective alterations and extensions were designed and all the necessary
approvals were sought. The garden and broader landscape setting were researched, designed and planted by Tanny Freeman.

There must be hundreds of early manses, vicarages, and presbyteries across Australia which could tell stories similar to this house at Moruya. I happen to own a former manse at Port Fairy. It’s stone, larger and grander but the conservation issues are similar. We have conserved and rehung the original and second wallpapers in the front hall and rear passage. The first advice from conservators was “don’t bother” but we persevered and found conservators who would accept the challenge. The wallpapers are not necessarily easy to live with but the sparkle of the mica flecks in the imitation granite wallpaper is delightful.

In the end only limited areas of wallpaper were left exposed at the Moruya manse. It is a practical and understandable result. The journey through the conservation process, including the recording and samples of significant fabric retained by the Sydney Living Museums, formerly the NSW HHT, is as important as the end result. This is, especially through the publication of this book, an excellent example of conservation according to the Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter. I have one minor quibble: why a cottage built in 1865 should be described as Georgian, even if its style and form are traditional to and evocative of an earlier period. The endnotes and index are useful. There could have been a brief list for further readings on historic wallpapers in Australia such as the HHT’s own *The decorated wall: eighty years of wallpaper in Australia, c. 1850-1930* by Phyllis Murphy (1981). The book is easy to read and beautifully produced. It is well illustrated with maps, old photographs, details images of the wallpapers and linings, and before and after shots of the works, as well as Peter Freeman’s usual engaging drafting of plans, elevations and atmospheric sketches.

Sydney Living Museums sold the manse late in 2012 after a job well-done by everyone involved including the community which is Moruya.

Timothy Hubbard
Heritage Architect and Planner, Port Fairy, Victoria